

# *Royalston Historic District Commission*

*Royalston, Massachusetts, 01368*

## Meeting Minutes

Date: June 24, 2010

Attendees: Celt Grant (Vice-chair), Bob Casinghino, Pierre Humblet (secretary), Ken Lively and Andy West. All were active voters.

Celt opened the meeting at 7:40 PM.

### Minutes

After the Commission members had read the minutes of the May 20 meeting and no corrections were requested, Bob motioned to approve the minutes as written. Pierre seconded. All voted in favor except Andy who abstained, as he was not present in May.

### New business

#### Hearing

At 7:42 Celt opened the hearing on John McClure's application for a certificate of appropriateness to replace the 6/6 and 3/3 wooden windows on his house at 8 N.E. Fitzwilliam Rd.

No letters had been received on this matter. Stephen Chase, a neighbor, was present.

John explained that the proposed windows differed from those described on the application. He now had a brochure describing them.

They are Andersen Woodwright insert replacement windows, made of wood with an aluminum exterior coated with white vinyl. They will have external and internal muntins glued to the double pane low-E glass.

In answer to questions John said that he wants to replace eleven 6/6 windows and three 3/3 windows. He will remove all the storm windows. Pierre asked about the exterior muntin width. John wasn't sure. Pierre requested that the width not exceed 7/8".

After John's explanations, Steve stood up and said that replacing wood windows was neither historically correct nor ~~not~~ cost effective. He presented material from the National Trust for Historic Preservation supporting this position. Essentially the new windows will need to be replaced in 20 or 30 years, while the old ones have been there for 100 years or more. It is more cost effective to simply fix the leaks around the old ones and to use them with storm windows.

Pierre then presented several window repair and replacement options and their approximate costs. There are much cheaper and more historic looking solutions than what John is proposing, but they have wood exterior. John insists on having more durable material because the wood patio doors installed in 1992 have now rotted.

Pierre also pointed out that in 2004 the HDC had authorized new double glass windows with glued exterior muntins for the Bastille.

In answer to a question from Celt, Steve stated that completely refurbishing ~~an~~ old windows (down to removing and reinstalling the glass) was basically as expensive as installing the windows proposed by John.

# *Royalston Historic District Commission*

*Royalston, Massachusetts, 01368*

There were also some questions about gas escaping through the double pane joint and the look of the screen.

Celt closed the hearing at 8:40.

The regular meeting resumed. As John had not prepared an amended application, there was nothing to vote on. However the members felt they should give their voting inclination to John.

- Bob felt he could support the revised application.
- Celt agreed with Stephen Chase on restoring old windows, but would not object to John's proposal.
- Ken felt strongly that wood windows should be preserved and didn't commit to approve John's proposal.
- Andy also objected to the principle of removing old windows with true divided light, but would not oppose John's proposal. However he disliked insert replacement windows, glued muntins, double glass and vinyl cladding, as they are not historic materials.
- Pierre stated he also agreed with Stephen and that he would not replace his own old wood windows, but he would go along with John's proposal. He felt that the presence of external muntins would preserve much of the historic look while the window material (wood vs. vinyl vs. aluminum) and the glass width reduction (caused by the insert frame) would be hard to notice. He liked the fact that the existing storm windows would be removed.

Celt then asked Dan Schodek to present his application to erect a garden trellis at the back of his property at 1 Frye Hill Road, which Dan did. The commission felt that a Certificate of Appropriateness was required for this case and that the application was detailed enough, considering the great distance from any public way. Bob moved to accept the application for consideration, without requiring a public hearing. Ken seconded. All voted in favor. The application was assigned number 2010-06-01.

## Old business

Andy read the application 2010-05-02 from the Bundschuhs to install a screen on the South Porch at 17 on the Common. The screen will follow a previously installed design, except that it will be positioned on the interior side of the columns.

At its May meeting, the commission had waived the public hearing. Pierre stated that the neighbors had been notified and that none had requested a hearing.

After a short discussion Pierre moved to accept the application. Bob seconded. All voted in favor.

Ken reported that the trees in front of the dish antenna at 3 on the Common have now been planted in the soil (having lived in pots for a year). Bob moved that we write a letter to the Church board, stating that the dish antenna must be removed, reminding them of the promise made by the pastor, and asking to respond to us with their intentions by July 15. Bob seconded. All voted in favor, except Ken and Pierre who recused themselves as abutters.

Ken also announced that Henry Cole had removed the large propane tank from 7 on the Common and installed a smaller upright tank, invisible from public ways. Pierre will send a thank you letter.

*Royalston Historic District Commission*  
*Royalston, Massachusetts, 01368*

Meeting adjourned

Bob motioned to close the meeting. Ken seconded. All voted in favor. Celt closed the meeting at 10:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "P.A. Humblet". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above the printed name.

Pierre A. Humblet,  
Secretary